

Staff Report

If this information is required in an alternate accessible format, please contact the Accessibility Coordinator at 905-623-3379 ext. 2131.

Report To:	General Government Committee	
Date of Meeting:	September 13, 2021	Report Number: CAO-005-21
Submitted By:	Andrew C. Allison, CAO	Resolution#:
File Number:		By-law Number:
Report Subject:	Executive Recruiting Services for Recruitment of a Chief Administrative Officer	

Recommendations:

1. That Report CAO-005-21 be received;
2. That Staff be authorized to use the process as outlined in Report CAO-005-21 and the Purchasing Manager be authorized to issue a limited invitation Request for Proposal to selected companies (i.e. 4 to 6 firms) with proven expertise in executive recruiting service and to submit proposals based on the scope of work as outlined in Attachment 1 of Report CAO-005-21;
3. That a CAO Selection Committee be established to,
 - a) select a recruitment firm to assist with a recruitment of a CAO; and
 - b) work with the recruitment firm to recommend to Council a short list of candidates to interview for the CAO's position;
4. That the CAO Selection Committee consist of the Mayor, an executive with senior leadership experience in public sector organizations and a Member of Council;
5. That a vote be conducted to appoint a Member of Council to the CAO Selection Committee in accordance with the Appointment Policy; and
6. That Staff report back to Council with a recommendation for an award of contract to an executive recruiting firm.

Report Overview

The purpose of this Report is to recommend to Council a process to select a new Chief Administrative Officer.

1. Background

- 1.1 On September 7, 2021, Andy Allison formally provided notice that he would be retiring. His last day in the office will be January 28, 2022.
- 1.2 The process recommended in this report mirrors the process outlined in [Report CAO-007-16](#), and subsequent amendments made by Council, when Council last hired a CAO in 2016/2017.

2. Process

- 2.1 The process for selecting a CAO is frequently done through a professional executive recruiting firm, as it was in 2016/2017. Using this process, the Municipality would first solicit proposals from qualified executive recruiting firms, then interview and select a qualified recruiting firm. The Municipality, under the guidance of Council and the recruiting firm, would agree on the qualifications and attributes they are seeking in a CAO.
- 2.2 The recruiter is then directed to find candidates who best fit the description developed by the Municipality. When the recruiter is confident that they have a strong representation of qualified candidates, the recruiter performs an initial "screening" interview of the top candidates. This list is further shortened through an interview with a panel and an assessment process.
- 2.3 At the end of this stage of the process, a short list is sent to Council for their consideration and Council interviews the selected candidates. Often, after the initial interviews by Council, candidates may be invited back for a second, more extensive, interview, after which an offer is made to the preferred candidate. Usually, there is a brief negotiation before terms are agreed on and a contract is signed. The entire process (after a recruiting firm has been selected) will typically take between eight and ten weeks. It may take longer based on availability of candidates and Council.

3. Selecting a Recruiting Firm

- 3.1 If directed by Council, Staff will develop a Scope of Work, based on the Scope of Work from 2016, to be included in a Request for Proposal (RFP) which will be sent to select executive recruiting firms. The list of firms to be invited to participate will be developed by reaching out to human resource professional in comparable municipalities who have had positive experiences with executive recruiting firms. As a requirement of the RFP, these companies will be required to meet several mandatory pass/fail criteria including successful reference checks, proven financial stability and adherence to the terms and conditions of the RFP document.
- 3.2 To permit a fair, and objective, evaluation of the proposals, proponents will be evaluated based on pre-determined selection criteria and a points summary (see Attachment 2)
- 3.3 Only proponents who achieve a minimum technical threshold score of 85% of the total technical points will be moved to the next stage, i.e. presentation/demonstration (if necessary) and the opening of their cost of service envelope thereafter. It is the intention to award a contract to the proponent who has met the passing threshold for both the technical and presentation phases and has provided the lowest overall cost. A CAO Selection Committee consisting of the Mayor, a Councillor to be chosen by Council, and an executive with senior leadership experience in a public sector organization will evaluate the Proposals. This Selection Committee for choosing the recruitment services will also serve as the Selection Panel for the recruiter to work with in the recruitment process.
- 3.4 Alternatively, Council could direct Staff to negotiate and enter into a single source contract with Western Management Consultants (the recruiting firm that undertook the work in 2016/2017) with an established upset limit.

4. Timing

- 4.1 The schedule below represents Staff's best estimate of the length of time it will take to award a contract to an executive recruiting firm if an RFP process is undertaken. Some actions may by-pass the General Government Committee and go directly to Council given the timelines.
 - (a) September 20, 2021 Council meeting - Council approves Scope of Work
 - (b) September 22, 2021 - Release of RFP to executive recruiting firms
 - (c) October 3, 2021 - Deadline for submitting questions: 3 business days prior to closing date
 - (d) October 6, 2021 - Closing Date for RFP Submissions

(e) October 18, 2021 Council meeting - Recruiter Evaluation / Shortlist Report and approval from Council to award contract

(f) October 20, 2021 - Contract Award

4.2 Once an executive recruiting firm is chosen, the steps below could then be followed between October 20 and November 23:

Step 1 - Municipality & recruiting firm determine candidate profile

Step 2 - Recruiting firm advertise for applications for candidates

Step 3 - Application submissions received by recruiting firm

Step 4 - Recruiting firm screens and identifies short list of candidates

4.3 During the week of December 7, Council could call a Special Council meeting (set aside whole day) to interview candidates.

4.4 At the December 13, 2021 Council meeting, Council could formally appoint a new CAO (using a by-law similar to [By-law 2017-064](#)).

4.5 A new CAO could start in January 2022.

5. Budget

5.1 In 2016, the cost of the recruiting firm was approximately \$38,000. It is expected that the cost will be in this range with consideration for inflation.

5.2 Since this an unbudgeted expense, the cost could be covered from Account No. 100-00-000-00000-2926 (Reserve – Consulting / Professional Fees).

6. Conclusion

It is respectfully recommended that a limited RFP be issued for the services of an executive recruitment firm to assist Council in filling the position of Chief Administrative Officer; that a CAO Selection Committee be established; and that staff report back to the Council with a recommendation for an award of contract to the successful executive recruitment firm.

Staff Contact: June Gallagher, Municipal Clerk, jgallagher@clarington.net, 905-623-3379 ext. 2102.

Attachments:

Attachment 1 – Scope of Work for Recruitment Firm

Attachment 2 – Selection Criteria for Recruitment Services

Attachment 1

Scope of Work for RFP

Executive and Senior Management Recruitment Firm

Purpose

The purpose of this RFP is to secure the services of an executive recruitment firm for the recruitment of a candidate to fill the position of Chief Administrative Officer for the Corporation of the Municipality of Clarington (the Municipality).

Background

The Municipality of Clarington is located in the Region of Durham, approximately 60 kilometres east of downtown Toronto. It is one of eight lower tier municipalities that comprise the Region of Durham. At 612km² and with a population of approximately 100,000 people and growing, Clarington is a blend of rural countryside and four bustling urban areas: Courtice, Bowmanville, Newcastle and Orono. The rural area has 15 hamlets which are surrounded by highly productive agricultural land and natural heritage features.

The Municipality is comprised of approximately 330 full-time and 400 part-time employees. The Municipality's organizational structure consists of 6 Departments reporting to the CAO. The CAO reports directly to Council.

Scope of Work

- a) Consulting with a panel to develop a job profile to reflect the skills and requisites of the position, including key competencies, selection criteria, processes and timeframes.
- b) Identifying a dedicated senior lead contact for providing ongoing communication with our panel.
- c) Identifying and evaluating/assessing high quality, diverse candidates using a variety of positions-specific search strategies, including outreach to diverse communities and to evaluate the competencies and to ensure that the selected candidate is a "good fit" with the Municipality's vision and mission.
- d) Identifying and using the appropriate types of advertising for the search to achieve a long list of qualified candidates and review with client to develop a short list.
- e) Identifying potential candidates from existing database.

- f) Screening, interviewing and short-listing candidates using methods appropriate to the position in addition to providing information as to why each candidate is short-listed.
- g) Facilitating and developing assessment methods, including interview questions and advanced assessment methods to analyse factors including but not limited to political acumen, strategic decision-making and understanding the management systems and processes to support effectiveness in a local government setting, government relations, emotional intelligence, analytical ability, conflict resolution, community economic development leadership and team building experience.
- h) Recommending a short list of candidates for interview with the panel and with Council and participate in the interview process to assist in final selection.
- i) Conducting background, reference and credential checks in consultation with the client.
- j) Assisting with negotiating terms and conditions of employment with selected candidate in accordance with established parameters.
- k) Ensuring that services meet deadlines and are within approved budget.
- l) Maintaining all files/records related to search assignment for reporting and auditing purposes.
- m) Assisting the selected candidate in transitioning in the new position.

It is expected that an award will be made following the October 18, 2021 Council meeting and the assignment completed by November 23, 2021 to enable the selected candidate to assume the CAO role in January 2022.

Attachment 2

Selection Criteria for Recruitment Services

EVALUTION CRITERIA	MAXIMUM PERCENTAGE AVAILABLE	MAXIMUM POINTS AVAILABLE
STAGE 1: Compliance with Mandatory Submission Requirements	PASS/FAIL	
STAGE 2: PROPOSAL STRUCTURE, ATTRIBUTES AND CONTENTS		
A. Experience and Qualification working with Public Sector Organization - Proponent’s Company history of recruiting experience with comparable municipal, public sector, broader public sector organizations as well as government agencies, boards and commissions. - Extensive experience recruiting public/private sector executive and senior management positions which resulted in successful hires. - Understanding of the Municipality, its operations, culture and how the complexity of the political environment relates to recruitment methods utilized.	25%	100
B. Proposed Staff and Team Resources - Dedicated senior contact person who has the necessary qualifications to provide executive and senior management recruitment services. - Senior level staff with considerable experience recruiting in the public sector.	10%	40
C. Strength of the Proposed methodology/ Quality of Services Provided Demonstrates proposed methodology and approach to managing executive and senior management recruitment services from initial consultation with client to final job offer acceptance, including a description of phased activities, briefings or reports, how communications and consultation will be handled and the roles, and estimated time involvement, of Municipal Council and panel.	35%	140

EVALUTION CRITERIA	MAXIMUM PERCENTAGE AVAILABLE	MAXIMUM POINTS AVAILABLE
- Proponent shows creative approach to investigating best practices and determining what is appropriate for the Municipality of Clarington. Through this information proponents should demonstrate: - Their experience, including recruitment methods utilized, in referring qualified candidates from diverse groups for executive and senior management level positions by providing specific examples; - Extensive experience using various recruitment techniques, including effective assessment approaches; - An understanding of employment-related legislation (e.g. human rights, employment equity, AODA) as it relates to the public sector recruitment process.		
D. Work Plan Deliverables/ Timelines - Proponent's ability to provide service that meets deadlines, a detailed work plan with information regarding the average length of time required to recruit executive and senior management positions from initial consultation with client to final job offer acceptance, including the average timeframes for key steps/deliverables in the process. - Indication of the Proponents average time to fill an executive or senior management position. - Indication of the Proponent's average senior assignment retention rates - Proponent's provision for replacement/ reimbursement if new hire is not successful or resigns within 2 years	30%	120
Total (A+B+C+D) Proponent must score a minimum of 85% (or 340 points) to qualify for the short list and further evaluation	100%	400

EVALUTION CRITERIA	MAXIMUM PERCENTAGE AVAILABLE	MAXIMUM POINTS AVAILABLE
STAGE 3: INTERVIEW STAGE (if required)		
STAGE 4: COST OF SERVICE		
Rank		

Proponents must score a minimum of 85% or (340 points out of 400 available points) in their technical submission for further consideration and the pricing envelope to be opened.

The Selected Proponent will be the Proponent who has met the passing threshold for both technical submission and presentation/demonstration (if required) and has the lowest overall cost.